Emotion, Communication, and Reading

Keith Oatley University of Toronto

Mora Institute, Mexico 5 September 2018 George Eliot (pen-name of Mary Anne Evans), perhaps England's most important novelist, thought of her writings as:

a set of experiments in life—an endeavour to see what our thought and emotion may be capable of—what stores of motive, actual or hinted as possible, give promise of a better after which we can strive.

In *Daniel Deronda*, she wrote:

... for those of us who struggle for our wisdom, the higher life must be a region in which the affections are clad with knowledge.

By "affections" she meant emotions that draw us to towards activities or people.



What is an emotion?

Something happens outside or within, that elicits our attention.

Appraisal: What is it? How does it affect me? What might I do about it?

Communication: Engagement of a certain kind with others, talking with others about the emotion.

Appraisal

Magda Arnold introduced the term **Appraisal**, which has now become standard in research on emotions. It means evaluation.

Unlike perception of what occurs outside us, and unlike our inner ideas, an emotion is usually based on an appraisal to relate something outside—usually about another person with what's within: a concern or an intention. Sometimes of course it's an idea that relates to a concern or intention.

The emotion then takes priority over other matters.

Emotions, then, are at the very centre of psychology, and of our selves.

Concerns and Emotions

A concern based in evolution: danger

Fear of getting hurt

A social concern for a loved one: is this person alright?

Happiness at seeing a friend whom one has not seen for a while

A political concern, about an injustice:

Anger at wrong-doing

In each of us, and in our societies, most of life's satisfactions are based in emotions: about our families, our friends, our achievements. And so are most of our troubles: our sadness at losses, our anxieties about selves and loved-ones, our feelings of depression, of discontent, of anger.

- How do we find out about emotions and what they mean? An important method is that of emotion diaries.
- In 1926 Georgina Gates published a study of 51 women whom she asked to keep emotion diaries of episodes of anger. These episodes occurred on average 2.85 times a week. They usually arose from having an intention prevented, most often by a person rather than a thing.
- In 1934 Marion Milner, under the pen-name of Joanna Field, published *A Life of One's Own*, based on keeping an emotion diary in which she tried to see what kinds of events made her happy. Instead she found that her life was mainly driven by anxieties on the edge of consciousness, most usually about other people. As a result of this diary-research, she changed her career and became a psychoanalyst. Bringing to consciousness anxieties of the kind she discovered became the basis of cognitive-behavioral therapy.





Histogram derived from diary records of 47 employed women and men asked to write accounts of their next four emotions—What happened? What was the emotion? How intense? Who were you with? These were classified into five kinds of emotions. Positive emotions tended to help intentions, negative emotions tended to impede them.

Keith Oatley & Elaine Duncan (1994). The experience of emotions in everyday life. *Cognition and Emotion, 8,* 369-381.

Emotions and Engagement With Others

Most emotions configure relationships.

They are like scripts that actors use on the stage.

In a play or a film, scripts are of words from which actors portray relationships with other characters. Emotion-scripts are the other way round. They set up relationships and, in everyday life, we find the words to fit.

Emotions Configure Relationships

In William Shakespeare's (1595) *A Midsummer Night's Dream* members of the audience see effects of having juice of "a little western flower" dripped into a sleeper's eyes. In the sleeper it causes an emotion: to fall in love with the first person she or he sees on waking.

So when, on waking after receiving this juice in her eye, Titania, Queen of the Fairies, sees a man called Nick Bottom, a weaver, who has been transformed into a donkey, she falls in love with him.

She says:

I pray thee gentle mortal, sing again. Mine ear is much enamoured of thy note; And thy fair virtue's force perforce doth move me On the first view to say, to swear, I love thee (3, 1, 130-133).

Modes of Emotion and Their Interpersonal Scripts

Imagine two people, Anna and Beatrice

- Beatrice smiles at Anna; Anna feels happy, smiles back and moves towards cooperation
- Beatrice is in tears; Anna feels sad, too, and tries sympathetically to help
- Beatrice frowns; Anna senses opposition and feels angry, so they enter into conflict
- Beatrice cries out in alarm; Anna becomes frightened, too, along with Beatrice

Our Species Works by us Humans being able to Make Cooperative Arrangements with Each Other

The most important research in psychology in the first two decades of this century is likely to be that of Michael Tomasello and his colleagues. They have shown that, unlike all other animals, the human species is based on cooperation. This has happened in two ways. First, we make arrangements with others and carry them out, with joint arrangements becoming more important than individual concerns: a shared goal and intention take priority over individual goals and intentions. Second we cooperate to create societies, and technologies, and a sense of morality that we share.

Emotions of friendly cooperation enable us to interact with others, to meet with partners, to raise families, to create our communities with housing, transport, and other kinds of technology.

Economists tell us we are selfish: so you do this for me and I'll do that for you, then we both gain individually. They have it the wrong way round. Really, we humans cooperate, so activities like buying, selling, and business deals, are based on happy and friendly cooperation, and principles of economics are a useful result.

Michael Tomasello (2014). A natural history of human thinking. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.

Effects of Reading on Emotional Well-Being and Citizenship

Four issues:

•Members of the human species cooperate; to do so we need to understand each other. Reading fiction improves emotion-based empathy and understanding of others.

•Historically, reading fiction has enabled us to identify emotionally with others; this has been central to invention of human rights.

•More widely, more equality in a nation or other society enables everyone to do better, and it is likely that reading contributes to this.

•In terms of mental health, reading artistic literature enables us to change ourselves, and reduce emotional avoidance.

To Cooperate We Need To Understand Each Other

This is the deep point about reading.

To cooperate, we need to understand each other. Reading, especially the reading of fiction, enables us to do this better.

Reading and Skills

Keith Stanovich and Richard West invented the Author Recognition Test in which people are given a list of names, such as Laurette Larocque, Jane Austen, Katrina Fong, Octavio Paz ... and asked to check those they recognize as names of authors of books. Scores on this test give an accurate estimate of the amount of reading a person has done and continues to do as measured by diary studies, questionnaires, interviews, and behavioural methods.

In a range of papers Stanovich, West, and colleagues used a statistical test in which everything that could contribute to general knowledge, verbal skills, and reasoning ability—IQ, age, years of education, and so on—were included. Then all but the amount of reading, as measured by the Author Recognition Test, were subtracted out, one by one. After all these subtractions, it was found the amount of reading people did, and had done, made a substantial difference.

The more a person reads the better is that person's general knowledge, verbal skills, and skills in most kinds of reasoning. Raymond Mar and Marina Rain found that nearly all this effect came from reading fiction.

Keith Stanovich, Richard West & Michelle Harrison (1995). Knowledge growth and maintenance across the life span: The role of print exposure. *Developmental Psychology, 31*, 811-826.

Raymond Mar & Marina Rain (2015). Narrative fiction and expository nonfiction differentially predict verbal ability. *Scientific Studies of Reading*, *19*, 419-433.

Fiction, Empathy, Understanding Others

In our research group in Toronto, Raymond Mar had the idea of to modify Stanovich & Wests Author Recognition Test, to include about the same number of authors of fiction (e.g. Toni Morrison) and of non-fiction (e.g. Stephen Hawking), to estimate the amount of fiction and non-fiction people read. We looked to see whether reading fiction could predict performance on:

• A test of empathetic understanding of others: The Mind in the Eyes Test

• A test of social perception: The Interpersonal Perception Test

Raymond Mar, Keith Oatley, et al. (2006). Bookworms versus nerds: The social abilities of fiction and non-fiction readers. *Journal of Research in Personality, 40,* 694-712.



desire

convinced

Simon Baron-Cohen et al. (2001). Item from the the 36-item "Reading the Mind in the Eyes" Test Revised version: A study with normal adults, and adults with Asperger's syndrome or high-functioning autism. 001) *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*, *42*, 241-251.

Partial correlations (measures of association) between reading fiction or non-fiction from the Author Recognition Test and two measures of social ability: Mind in the Eyes (MIE) and Interpersonal Perception Task (IPT-15)



(Mar, Oatley, Hirsh, dela Paz, & Peterson, 2006)

Reading Fiction Improves Empathy and Understanding of Others

Our original finding was based on an association between the amount of reading people do generally, as estimated by the Author Recognition Test, and measures of social understanding. The publications was influential. In a situation like this the next step is to do experiments, to make sure the effect is causal.

In most experiments on this issue, people have been asked to read just a single short-story, to be compared with other people who read a control text, such as an essay. So in studies of this kind, the effect or reading a story is not large. In a statistical method called meta-analysis based on 53 estimates of the sizes of effects in 14 experimental studies, the causal effects were found to be robust and reliable.

Over a life-time such effects become cumulative. The effect of life-time reading of fiction, on empathy and understanding of others, that has been found by us and several other research groups, using the Author Recognition Test is much larger than the effects of experimental studies, and probably more accurate for understanding the importance for people.

Overall this effect is likely to be important in people who read books of fiction.

Dodell-Feder, D., & Tamir, D. I. (2018). Fiction reading has a small positive impact on social cognition: A metaanalysis. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General*. doi: 10.1037/xge0000395



Yellow = overlap of comprehending narrative and understanding others measured in non-story way; Red= comprehending narrative; Green = understanding others measured in non-story way; Blue = comprehending narrative and understanding others as measured by stories (A,B,C,D,E, are slices through the brain)

This shows that some parts of the brain are involved both in comprehending narrative, and understanding other people

Mar, R. (2011). The neural bases of social cognition and story comprehension. *Annual Review of Psychology, 62,* 103-134.

Reading Books Associated with Living Longer

Avni Bavishi et al. did a 12-year follow-up of 3635 people who reported on habits of reading books, magazines, and newspapers. Information was also gathered about participants' age, sex, ethnic background, education, health care, wealth, marital status and depression.

As compared with people those who did not do so, people who read books lived 23 months longer. The difference remained substantial even when factors such as education, wealth, and so on, had been subtracted out. The researchers were not able to include a measure of cognitive ability, such as IQ.

A study by the National Endowment for the Arts indicates that 87% of book readers read fiction, so the effects found by Bavishi et al. is likely to be due to the reading of fiction.

Bavishi, A., Slade, M. D., & Levy, B. R. (2016). A chapter a day: Association of book reading with longevity. Social Science and Medicine, 164, 44-48.

National Endowment for the Arts. (2009). Reading on the rise: A new chapter in American literacy. Washington, DC: National Endowment for the Arts.

What Is Fiction?

Fiction is not best understood as an opposite of fact.

Shakespeare called it a dream. In modern terms this means something like a model of the world, in particular the social world. So it is not a description. More technically it is called a simulation, in which there are **complexities.** In a similar way we now have simulations of the earth's climate, that predict that the climate is changing.

So in reading fiction, or in going to a play or a film, we can compare the world we know with an imagined, but possible, version of the world.

Keith Oatley (2016). Fiction: Simulation of social worlds. *Trends in Cognitive Sciences, 20*, 618-628.

What Do We Mean by "complexities"?

Imagine Anna and Beatrice again.

We are good at understanding things one at a time, so if Anna is angry with Beatrice, we can understand this.

But what if we add other elements? What if Beatrice is Anna's four-yearold daughter, and the mother doesn't want to upset her? Or what if Anna and Beatrice are thinking of living with each other and Anna doesn't want to scare Beatrice off?

Simulations (models), such as those of fiction, enable us to understand more than one thing at a time: complexities.

Emotion and stories

Most stories are about emotion, and based on intention

Concern/Intention/Act — Outcome and emotion

Jerome Bruner said that narrative thinking (including fiction) is about human intentions that meet problems, usually contrived by an antagonist or by society.

Stories and emotion in everyday life

Concern/Intention/Act Positive emotions: happiness, satisfaction, etc.

Antagonist pushes back (downward arrows)

Negative emotions: anger, anxiety, etc.

Jerome Bruner (1986). Actual minds, possible worlds. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

What is Fiction? Stories From Around the World

Patrick Hogan gathered and read stories from societies all round the world from before the age of European colonization. He found three kinds of stories, all based in emotion, have been told, and continue to be told, almost everywhere. They are about problems in human life that are important, but which we don't always know how to solve, because of their complexity. Fictional stories enable us to think about such problems more deeply, and with a wider range of possibilities.

Most common, world-wide, is the love story, usually about lovers who long to be united but are opposed by another person. An example is *Romeo and Juliet*. Second most common is the story of anger and conflict, for instance the *Ramayana*, about two brothers, one of whom has tried to displace the other. Third is a story of a crisis of suffering in society, in which someone comes to understand the crisis, and sacrifices her or his life, to save the society. The Christian gospel is of this kind.

Patrick Hogan (2003). *The mind and its stories: Narrative universals and human emotion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Putting Aside One's Daily Concerns

So when we read, it's like meditation. As we pick up a novel or short story, we put to one side our day-to-day concerns, and enter another world with which we can then compare the world that we know.

We insert the intentions of a story-character into that part of our mind with which we usually make our own plans. In this way we imagine ourselves into other lives, into other societies, and take part in a character's actions.

When the author tells us what events occur as a result of these intentions and actions, we experience emotions.

These are not the emotions of the character, but our own emotions, in the circumstance that the character enters.

The historian Lynn Hunt showed that the idea of human rights was not always with us. It had to be invented. This happened about 250 years ago, and led to the abolition of slavery in Europe and the Americas.

An important contributor was fiction, in which people could identify with others who were unlike them. One influential novel, was *Pamela*, published in 1740 by Samuel Richardson, about a servant woman whose master wanted to have sex with her.



Extending this idea in a way that helps us think about citizenship, John Rawls explains what he calls the **"Original Position."**

Imagine that, in this position, before we are born, with a small group of other people we discuss what kind of society we would like to live in. We do this before we know whether we will be female or male, where we will be born, what colour our skin will be, whether or not we will be good-looking, what abilities we will have.

We are likely, jointly and cooperatively, to choose a society in which, with whatever traits and abilities each of us is given by chance, we can develop our potential to the full. If, by doing this, we gather more resources than others we will contribute more to others who are less fortunate and have fewer abilities than ourselves. Rawls calls this "fairness" and says it's the basis of justice and citizenship in society.



Nineteenth-century invention: progressive income tax

Although we may think of steam-engines and automobiles as important inventions of the nineteenth-century, probably more important was progressive income tax, in which the more you earn, the more tax you pay; and if you earn very little you don't pay tax. In Britain, for instance, a bill to introduce this arrangement was passed in 1842.

This is one way in which Rawls's idea of justice as fairness can be, and has been, implemented. It leads to societies that are more fair and more equal.

Prevalence of Mental Illness in Five Countries with their Rates of Income-Inequality (Ratios of Top 20% of Incomes to Bottom 20% of Incomes)

Percentage of people who suffer from a mental illness in relation to inequality of income (data for the first four countries from Wilkinson & Pickett from a WHO survey of 1998, with USA inequality of income updated and data for Mexico added)

Richard Wilkinson & Kate Pickett (2009) *The Spirit Level: Why More Equal Societies Almost Always Do Better.*



Other Outcomes that Relate to Inequality of Income

As well as mental health, very similar results have are also found as follows.

More inequality in a society is associated with: Poorer physical health Shorter life-spans Poorer levels of education More people in prison More distrust

Reading May Contribute To Our Ideas Of Fairness

In the same way that Lynn Hunt showed that reading fiction enabled people to imagine the lives of other people, and work towards the idea of human rights, it may also help establish the idea of justice as fairness, and work towards greater equality.

This has not yet been shown in psychological studies. It is a hypothesis.

Consider how every love story is about finding the right partner, with whom one can cooperate so that together both can achieve their potential. Consider how every detective story is about achieving justice.

A Difficulty, but Perhaps a Movement Towards Solutions

A difficulty with this is that within society we can experience events of greed, corruption, conflict, and violence. How might we move from this towards cooperation and citizenship? As Steven Pinker shows in *The Better Angels of Our Nature*, in Europe over the last 700 years, there has been a 33-times reduction of the proportion of individuals who kill each other (homicides). The main cause was the establishment of states, and of people coming to experience themselves as citizens. As Pinker points out, in USA high rates of homicide still occur among people who were excluded as citizens because they were descended from slaves. As compared with many other countries, in USA there is more distrust of government.

Movement towards cooperative citizenship for everyone may be helped as Lynn Hunt found, by reading fiction and improving empathy, which contributed to the abolition of slavery and establishment of civil rights. Perhaps too, this may be a way of hastening the movement towards fairness and justice for all in society.

Reading Rooms may make an important contribution to people feeling included.

Independent and Inter-Dependent Societies

- On the theme of how people in different societies interact and cooperate, in 1991 Hazel Markus and Shinobu Kitayama published a paper in which they analyzed different societies.
- They found that in some societies, such as those of Europe and USA, people are more independent.
- In other societies, for instance Japan, China, and Latin America including Mexico, people are more inter-dependent: they depend on each other, and relate with each other more. Might one say there is more trust in societies of this kind?
- Hazel Markus & Shinobu Kitayama (1991). Culture and the self: Implications for cognition, emotion and motivation. *Psychological Review, 98*, 224-253.

In a study based on diary methods, Nairán Ramiréz-Esparza and her colleagues found that in the individualist society of USA people tended to be more independent, more private, and socialized more with people who were absent, for instance on the phone. In contrast, Mexicans were more inter-dependent, and socialized more widely, more with people who were present, more with people in groups.

Ramiréz-Esparza, N., Mehl, M., R., Álvarez-Bermuúdez, J., & Pennebaker, J. W. (2009). Are Mexicans more or less sociable than Americans? Insights from a naturalistic observation study. *Journal of Research in Personality, 43*, 1-7.



Effects of Reading on Changing Oneself

Maja Djkic and I, with other colleagues, asked people to read either Anton Chekhov's short story "The lady with the little dog" (literary art condition) or a non-fictionalized version that was less artistic (control condition). Before reading we measured people's styles of attachment and personality traits, and asked them to rate the intensity of ten emotions they were experiencing at the time.

The control text was written with the same characters, events and information as Chekhov's story. It was the same length and the same level of reading difficulty. Readers found it just as interesting though not as artistic as Chekhov's story.

After reading, all participants completed the test of personality traits, and rated the intensity of their emotions again.

Djikic, M., Oatley, K., et al. (2009). On being moved by art: How reading fiction transforms the self. *Creativity Research Journal*, 21, 24-29.

Effects of reading Chekhov's "The lady with the little dog" (Literary Art Condition) compared with a non-fictionalized account of the same events (Control Condition): mean levels of changes of personality traits and emotions after reading, as compared with traits and emotions before reading.



Note. N = 166.

Change in One's Own Way

As compared with those who read the control text, people who read Chekhov's literary short-story changed their personality (their selfhood) by small amounts, not all in the same direction, but in their own ways.

The amount of the change was mediated by the amount of emotion they felt while reading.

This is an effect of art rather than fiction as such. We have replicated the effect in a study of reading one of eight literary essays or one of eight literary short stories (Djikic, Oatley & Carland, 2012).

So far we have only found short-term effects, but we think that over time, such effects might cumulate.

Djikic, M., Oatley, K., & Carland, M. (2012). Genre or artistic merit: The effect of literature on personality. *Scientific Study of Literature*, *2*, 25.36.

Can Reading Literary Fiction Help With Mental Health Problems?

In our research group we tested the hypothesis that literature can reduce disengagement from others that occurs in people who are avoidantly attached, people whose emotions are damped down.

We asked the people in the study with Chekhov's story to complete the Attachment Style Questionnaire.

People who were avoidantly attached, as compared with those who were normally attached, experienced significantly more change, and more intense emotions, when reading Chekhov's literary story than did those in the control condition.

Maja Djikic, Keith Oatley, et al., (2009) Defenceless against art? Impact of reading fiction on emotion in avoidantly attached individuals. *Journal of Research in Personality, 43, 14-17*.

Relation between stories and consciousness

Stories and consciousness are of the same kind: they are mental models (simulations) of selves and others, made up from memories, plans, and current interactions with others.

Stories are carefully constructed pieces of consciousness that are externalized onto paper or computer screen to be improved, then passed to other people.

When we read, listen to, or watch a story, we take into our own minds a piece of consciousness that has been constructed in this way.

By running the model (simulation) of a story on our minds we can make this piece of consciousness our own. In this way, by entering and taking in pieces of the minds of others and by practicing the inferences of imagination, we can extend our own consciousness.

Changing Lives

Several projects have involved using reading to address problems within the justice system and in disadvantaged groups.

Robert Waxler, professor of english literature in Massachusetts, with a friend who was a judge, Robert Kane, started a program called Changing Lives Through Literature. The program, enables young offenders to be sentenced to probation rather than jail on condition that they attend a seminar on literature.

In Toronto, in 2000, Jo Altilia founded Literature for Life (based on a model that started in Chicago) which runs book clubs for teenage women who have become pregnant. Reading books about circumstances similar to their own, and discussing them with others can be transformative, can enable women to understand others and themselves better, and to talk about problems in a safe environment. Many book group participants say they read more often on their own after joining a book group. Altilia has reported that book club members "experience an increase in perspective-taking, empathy, and problem-solving as a result of their participation."

Trounstine, J. R. & Waxler, R. (2005). *Finding a voice: The practice of changing lives through literature.* Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press. Waxler, R. P. (2014). *The risk of reading: How literature helps us understand ourselves and the world.* New York: Bloomsbury.

Reading groups

Reading groups have enabled a democracy of interpretation. People discuss interpretations of books to create shared understandings, which are more complete and extensive than one can usually manage on one's own.

Reading-group discussions extend and enhance relationships among group members.

Incentives for reading

According to Elaine Maag, a senior research associate at the Urban-Brookings Tax Policy Center, one might offer a tax deduction for every novel middle- and high-income earners read (say, \$10 for any work of fiction, \$20 for a novel on a certain list that could be established, with the reading checked by a brief questionnaire). For low-income people who don't pay income tax, a direct payment rather than a tax credit could be made. Recipients would receive \$20 every time they check a listed book out of a library, or perhaps a Reading Room, and return it along with a completed questionnaire about the book.

Reading with Children

There is now research that indicates:

• Reading by parents of picture books with their children, and discussing them, is not only enjoyable, but enables parents to feel closer to their children, for the children to acquire better understanding of others, and to develop their language more quickly and fully. Then, they themselves come to read more.

• Children who read more tend to have better mental health, and to be less aggressive as adolescents and adults.

Example references

Whitehurst, G. J. & al. (1994). A picture book reading intervention in day care and home for children from low-income families. *Developmental Psychology, 30*, 679-689.

Vance, J. E., Fernandez, G., & Biber, M. (1998). Educational progress in a population of youth with aggression and emotional disturbance: The role of risk and protective factors. *Journal of Emotional and Behavioral Disorders, 6*, 214-221.

Colmar, S. H. (2014). A parent-based book-reading intervention for disadvantaged children with language difficulties. *Child Language Teaching and Therapy, 30*, 79-90.

Relations Among Writers, Readers, and Books

Two thousand years ago, the Roman poet Horace said that poetry (and literature generally) existed to give pleasure and to instruct. This continued to be accepted, but modern research indicates this is not a good way to think about it.

A writer of literary fiction does not attempt to instruct or persuade; so its quite unlike what advertizers or political candidates do. A literary author offers a book as a kind of gift that contains suggestions. It's a kind of open-ended kit by which a reader can use her or his imagination to create a possible world. The reader does this in a way that is personal and individual. So, in what is accomplished, the relative contributions of writer to reader are something like 20% to 80%.

As John Ruskin and Marcel Proust explained, a book is a kind of friend, about whom one doesn't worry "Did I say the right thing?" or "What did she/he think of me?" Unlike our day-to-day friends, book friends, or fictional-character-friends, don't depend on our circumstances. We can have such friends from anywhere in the world, at any place, at any time.

Marcel Proust's À la recherche du temps perdu

Not far into Proust's novel, we find this:

A real human being, however profoundly we sympathize with him, in large part is perceived through our senses, that is to say remains opaque to us, offers a dead weight that our sensibilities cannot lift. If a calamity should strike him, it is only in a small part of the total notion that we have of him that we will be able to be moved by this ... The novelist's happy discovery was to have the idea of replacing these parts, impenetrable to the soul, by an equal quantity of immaterial parts, that is to say parts which our soul can assimilate ... [the novelist] sets loose in us all possible happinesses and all possible unhappinesses, just a few of which we would spend years of our lives coming to know. (p. 87).

Marcel Proust (1913). In search of lost time, 1. The way by Swann's (trans. L. Davis). London: Penguin (current edition 2002).

Proust's draft of final sentences of *À la recherche du temps perdu*

125

... it would even be inexact to say that I thought of those who read it as readers of my book. Because they were not, as I saw it, my readers. More exactly they were readers of themselves, my book being a sort of magnifying glass ... by which I could give them the means to read within themselves.

Le temps retrouvé, p. 424.

Gallimard Folio, 1954 (my translation)

Fin.